Struggling to Achieve: Outcomes for Low-Income and Minority Students at Community Colleges

THOMAS R. BAILEY

As institutions that offer millions of people unparalleled access to education and economic opportunity, community colleges are shaping the lives of everyday Americans. The more than 11 million students currently enrolled reflect the equity mission upon which these institutions were founded, and in an era of often hollow educational promises, they are living proof that every American—in principle—can attend college.

Our research indicates that while baccalaureate granting institutions draw disproportionately from families with higher incomes, community colleges (public two-year institutions) enroll students in fairly even proportions across all income levels. Furthermore, with a similarly even student distribution across racial and ethnic categories, they are the gateway into higher education for the vast majority of first-generation college students. Indeed, the rates of enrollment at community colleges among these generally underserved populations have grown substantially in recent years.

Despite recent gains in postsecondary enrollment, African American, Hispanic, and low-income students are still struggling to complete undergraduate credentials on par with other students. Recent data reveal that minority, low-income, and first generation students earn credentials at lower rates and disproportionately fail to secure a degree from their community college, or to transfer successfully to a four-year institution. Therefore, while access to postsecondary education by minorities and low-income students has improved, we are concerned about unacceptably poor achievement results. With a declining proportion of minority students attending selective four-year institutions, policies that can support the performance of minorities at the community college level have taken on an added urgency. Success at community college is not simply valuable in its own right. For many of their students, the path to a degree and higher earnings over a lifetime runs through the community college.

Studies show that well over half of all first-time African American students who enroll in a community college drop out of school within six years. For those who do earn a credential, the majority earn a certificate rather than an associate degree. This disturbing pattern of disproportionately high dropout rates and attainment of lower level credentials among black students, when compared with the rates for all students, is common across all institution types—from those granting certificates to those granting bachelor’s degrees. Eight years after high school, 72% of African American community college students—compared with 50% of white community college students—have not earned a certificate, associate degree, or transferred. Ten percent of first-time black students who enrolled in community college earned an associate degree within six years, with only two percent completing a bachelor’s in the same time frame.

Latino students fare slightly better than African American students, but less well than white first-time students. Eighteen percent of first-time Latino students who enrolled in a community college earned an associate degree within six years, with five

Table of Contents

- Achieving the Dream: Community Colleges Count ........................................... 3
- Community Colleges and Minority Degree Attainment ..................................... 4
- Evaluating the Community College Bridges to Opportunity Initiative .............. 4
- Accelerating Student Success Through Credit-Based Transition Programs ...... 5
- Introducing the International Baccalaureate Program to Urban Middle Schools .. 5
- Announcements ........................................................................................................ 6
- CCRC Seminar Series ............................................................................................. 6
- Upcoming Conference Presentations .................................................................. 7
- Selected Publications .............................................................................................. 9
percent completing a bachelor’s in the same time frame. The comparable numbers for first-time white students are 23% and 12%. Eight years after high school, 63% of Latino community college students have not earned a credential, associate degree, or transferred, compared with slightly over half of all first-time community college enrollees.

The social-economic circumstances of community college students—and not just the outcomes themselves—may speak volumes about these individuals who have tremendous responsibilities that are both time-consuming and stressful. In addition, the financial burdens placed on them, many of whom have dependents and work at least part time, may explain why truncated degree and certification programs at for-profit “trade” schools, billed as pipelines into careers with immediate high earning potential, are viewed as necessary alternatives.

While minorities and low-income students are facing challenges in and out of the classroom, community colleges themselves are operating under a changing landscape of declining state and federal funding. Of increasing concern is tying accountability standards to the colleges’ multi-service agenda, with conflicting interests, increasing demand, diverse student goals, the emergence of for-profit degree-granting institutions, and ever tighter state budgets.

The expanding role of community colleges is almost certain to have direct implications for minority students, who are more likely than their white counterparts to be low income and products of failing public schools. With the reality of growing enrollments and reduced funding, services critical in retaining minority students, such as counseling and mentoring, are being cut. Since these students already face formidable obstacles, a consistent agenda about how community colleges can help at-risk students to succeed and achieve is imperative.

Developmental education appears to be far less effective for African Americans and Latinos than it is for whites. Minority students who start in developmental courses are much less likely to go on to complete a degree or certificate than such students who start in regular college courses. This disparity is much less pronounced for whites—white students who start in developmental courses complete degrees and certificates at close to the same rate as other white students. This may explain the high dropout rate of African American students who started in community colleges, with those who stayed opting for less challenging certificate programs, which generally do not require remedial coursework.

Family income significantly influences student achievement. Across all four-year and two-year institutions, students from families in the highest income quartile are more likely than their peers in the lowest income quartile to earn a credential or to transfer within six years. When low-income students do earn credentials, they are still stratified from wealthier students by earning certificates and associate degrees rather than bachelor’s degrees. Eight years after high school, two-thirds of low-income community college students still have not earned a credential, associate degree, or transferred, compared with slightly over half of all first-time community college enrollees.

The source of the data on six-year first-time student outcome and goals is the Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study 1996-2001. The National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988 provided the eight-year post-high school outcome data. All calculations are the author’s.

Thomas R. Bailey is the George and Abby O’Neill Professor of Economics and Education, and the Director of both the Community College Research Center and the Institute on Education and the Economy at Teachers College, Columbia University.

In the following pages, you will find descriptions of our current research related to issues of access to, and success in, postsecondary education. Also included are announcements of upcoming events and conference presentations, and a list of selected publications. Further information about all of our current and past research and downloads of our reports and briefs are available on the CCRC website. As always, we welcome your feedback.
ACHIEVING THE DREAM: COMMUNITY COLLEGES COUNT

Community college access and success are major themes of the Achieving the Dream: Community Colleges Count (AtD) initiative, in which CCRC, along with several other national organizations, is participating. The objective of this multi-year initiative, funded by Lumina Foundation for Education, is to improve the educational outcomes of students at community colleges, especially low-income and minority students. A particular emphasis of AtD is to use data and research to help these institutions better serve their underserved populations. CCRC is involved in several components of the AtD project, each of which is described below, including literature-based research; research on institutional effectiveness toward student success; a survey and analysis of the institutional research capacity of community colleges; and an examination of state policies that affect community college access and success for minority and low-income students. Finally, CCRC, along with other AtD partner organizations, is working with the 27 community colleges participating in AtD to develop and implement a longitudinal data system. This will help to identify groups of students who are having difficulty succeeding in their education and make it possible to gauge the impact of efforts to address these problems moving forward.

The CCRC review of the relevant literature on community college student enrollment and outcomes has been completed. The report, Improving Student Attainment in Community Colleges: Institutional Characteristics and Policies, is available on the CCRC website. Also authored by CCRC staff and available from Lumina Foundation is a report titled Paths to Persistence: An Analysis of Program Effectiveness at Community Colleges.

The study of institutional effectiveness for the AtD project seeks to identify community college practices and policies that are effective in serving low-income and minority students. While much has been written on student characteristics that promote success in postsecondary education, there has been surprisingly little research on the institutional characteristics that make community colleges effective. Part of the challenge of this investigation is separating the effect of distinct institutional policies and practices that affect student success from individual student factors.

In this study, CCRC will use data from selected states that collect information on the characteristics, progress, and outcomes of individual community college students. These student-level data will be combined with data on institutional characteristics collected in the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System to estimate the expected degree completion rate for each college in a given state, controlling for both student and institutional factors. We compare the actual to expected performance of each of the colleges to identify those that have higher or lower rates of student completion than would be expected, given the college’s student characteristics and institutional resources. The research, including collection of longitudinal data and site visits, will begin in Florida through a cooperative agreement with the Community College Division of Florida’s Department of Education. We anticipate that this will be the first of several states in which CCRC will carry out such research.

CCRC’s study of institutional research (IR) at community colleges focuses on how IR can relate to promoting student access and success. Although IR has been developing as a college function over the past two decades, little is known about its structure, operation, and contribution to community college practice. The roles and expectations of institution-based researchers are numerous, as they are responsible for providing data and reports to a variety of audiences, including state and federal governments, accreditation agencies, district and college administrators, faculty, and the general public. Yet, little systematic analysis has been done to learn about how these various roles are performed and balanced.

Our IR study consists of two parts. First, we conducted a randomized survey of IR directors and college employees responsible for the IR function. The goal of this survey was to obtain a nationwide snapshot of current structure, practices, and priorities. Second, we are conducting telephone interviews with IR directors, college presidents, vice presidents for academic affairs, and faculty representatives of 30 colleges located in 15 states. The goal of these interviews is to better understand the multiplicity of IR functions by finding out how IR is used within each college. In
addition, by comparing pairs of colleges within states, we expect to draw some conclusions about state support for IR.

The final component of CCRC’s work with AtD is the examination of state policies that affect community college access and success for minority and low-income students. In particular, we are examining what policies exist, their perceived impact on community colleges, and what additional policies education leaders and community advocates think are needed to improve access and success for the student populations. Types of policies investigated include those related to community college funding, student access, student success, and institutional performance accountability. Researchers are conducting intensive interviews with state and local community college officials, state legislators and staff, and representatives of organizations representing minority and low-income communities in five states (New Mexico, Texas, Florida, North Carolina, and Virginia). In addition, we are sending a survey questionnaire to similar officials in all 50 states.

COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND MINORITY DEGREE ATTAINMENT

CCRC has recently completed a project to examine the role of community colleges in promoting the educational attainment of blacks and Hispanics. This 18-month study, funded by the Ford Foundation, produced several pieces of research on community college student enrollments and completions using national datasets from the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), and a report using data from Washington State.

Although much research exists on factors explaining college student retention and graduation, most of that work is focused on baccalaureate students and uses the characteristics of individual students as explanatory variables. Our research develops analytical models that are based on the distinctive structures, missions, and funding mechanisms of community colleges and that incorporate relevant community college institutional characteristics into the explanatory measures of student outcomes. This work strives for a better understanding of the institutional factors of degree completion and transfer among students who enter higher education through community colleges.

The main report resulting from this research is The Effects of Institutional Factors on the Success of Community College Students. In addition to the analytical work described above, the report discusses the benefits and drawbacks to reliance on graduation rates as a measure of institutional effectiveness. It also explores the implications of our findings for community college practice and policy, with particular reference to the effects on minority and low-income students. Lumina Foundation for Education also provided financial assistance for this research.

To complement the national analyses, we used findings from a study of student record information from the Washington State Community and Technical College System to track the educational attainment and earnings outcomes over five years of adult students with a high school education or less who were entering the community college system for the first time. The results from this investigation are reported in Building Pathways to Success for Low-Skill Adult Students: Lessons for Community College Policy and Practice from a Statewide Longitudinal Tracking Study.

EVALUATING THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE BRIDGES TO OPPORTUNITY INITIATIVE

The Ford Foundation’s Community College Bridges to Opportunity initiative seeks to increase access of disadvantaged adults to postsecondary education. The six states (Colorado, Kentucky, Louisiana, New Mexico, Ohio, and Washington) funded through the initiative are attempting to bring together broad coalitions to press for changes in state policy that will improve educational and economic opportunities for low-income adults. CCRC is proud to be involved in this ambitious and worthwhile project.

CCRC is assisting the Ford Foundation by evaluating the activities and impacts of the initiative in all six states. Through multiple site visits to each state, project researchers are tracking current progress in order to assess the effectiveness of each state’s approach to implementing its plan. They are focusing on the coalition-building process and any preliminary impacts of that process on public policy and institutional practices. Another important focus is the states’ efforts to develop or improve their data collection systems. A sophisticated use of
data, especially unit-record, student tracking data, is a key part of the strategy since data can be used to identify areas for improvement, support mobilization of stakeholders, and assess the eventual effectiveness of strategies.

CCRC will also explore the implications of the project findings for community college policy and practice more generally, and will present a framework that states and colleges can use to evaluate the effectiveness of efforts to improve service to low-income adults.

ACCELERATING STUDENT SUCCESS THROUGH CREDIT-BASED TRANSITION PROGRAMS

The Office of Vocational and Adult Education (OVAE) of the U.S. Department of Education has funded the Accelerating Student Success through Credit-Based Transition Programs project, which in effect examines the access of under-achieving high school students to intensive preparation for college and to college-credit coursework. Initiatives that allow high school students to take college-level courses and potentially earn college credit, such as dual enrollment, Tech Prep, Advanced Placement, International Baccalaureate and middle college high schools, have existed for years, but often it has been students who are already college bound who take advantage of them. With the increasing national focus on the need for high academic standards, and the growing importance of obtaining a postsecondary credential, interest in such programs for low- and middle-achieving students by policymakers and practitioners has heightened.

CCRC researchers have conducted case studies of five diverse credit-based transition programs and are now completing a final report that will: (1) explore the possibility that such programs may be effective for middle- and low-achieving students, and (2) identify the programmatic characteristics that might help support middle- and low-achieving high school students in college courses and their transition from high school to college.

A previous report from the project, State Dual Enrollment Policies: Addressing Access and Quality, analyzed the dual enrollment policies of all 50 states, examining whether and how state policies encouraged or restricted the access of middle- and low-achieving high school students to dual enrollment opportunities.

INTRODUCING THE INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE PROGRAM TO URBAN MIDDLE SCHOOLS

High school and college educators frequently argue that in order to improve students’ chances of academic success it is necessary to begin working with them in middle school. This is precisely the approach taken by the International Baccalaureate Organization (IBO). The International Baccalaureate (IB) program emphasizes international education and rigorous assessments. The final two years of the program coincide with eleventh and twelfth grades and culminate with students earning IB diplomas. The IB diploma is recognized internationally and by many U.S. colleges as equivalent to Advanced Placement.

The IBO is currently implementing its Middle Years Programme (MYP) in middle schools across the U.S. As part of this initiative, the IBO obtained a grant through the U.S. Department of Education to implement MYP at five urban middle schools. Together, these middle schools are preparing over 2000 students to participate more effectively in the academically demanding high school program. During the 2004-05 school year, 63% of the students in the five grant schools were black or Hispanic and, for the three schools providing data, an average of 77% of the students were receiving free or reduced-price lunch. The MYP is a whole-school reform, rather than a separate program within the schools, so students of all academic levels are participating. As a result, the MYP has the potential to increase college access for low-income, minority, and special needs students, regardless of academic ability. MYP aims to challenge students with a rigorous curriculum and orient them towards a program that can eventually help smooth their way into college.

CCRC researchers are currently conducting a three-year implementation evaluation of the program and are in the process of visiting five middle schools. Each site visit consists of interviews with teachers, IB coordinators, and school principals, as well as classroom observations. In addition to these site visits, teachers are being surveyed for information about their views on the IB MYP program, school climate, and teacher efficacy. Results from years one and three of the implementation will be analyzed in order to develop a better understanding about the use of MYP for whole-school reform.
ANNOUNCEMENTS

CCRC RESEARCH FELLOWS GRADUATE

We are proud to announce that three CCRC research fellows have recently completed their doctorates in Economics and Education at Teachers College, Columbia University.

Mariana Alfonso was with CCRC for four years and is currently a post-doctoral Research Associate in Public Policy at A. Alfred Taubman Center for Public Policy and American Institutions, Brown University. Her dissertation is titled The Role of Educational Expectations and College Choice in Transfer and Baccalaureate Attainment of Community College Students.


MoonHee Kim is a Deputy Director at the Ministry of Education and Human Resources Development in Korea and worked at the CCRC for three years. The title of her dissertation is The Determinants of Institutional Financial Aid and its Effect on Degree Completion: The Difference Between Students at Public and Private Four-Year Institutions.

Each contributed a great deal to CCRC’s research agenda. We wish them great success.

CCRC SEMINAR SERIES

A MATTER OF DEGREES: THE ROLE OF COMMUNITY COLLEGES IN INCREASING POSTSECONDARY COMPLETIONS

The number of individuals in a community who possess postsecondary credentials is considered an important asset for economic growth and development. This is especially true for communities with large low-income populations who are not well-served by higher education.

In the past year, the state of Michigan, under the direction of a Commission on Higher Education assembled by the Governor, has developed innovative plans for increasing the number of its citizens with postsecondary credentials. In addition, the Achieving the Dream: Community Colleges Count initiative, funded by Lumina Foundation for Education, is a major effort to improve the educational outcomes of students at community colleges, especially low-income and minority students.

Seminar presenters directly involved in these two programs will discuss specific issues and examine solutions and lessons to be learned. The seminar will conclude with remarks from the leader of a major urban community college who will discuss the practical institutional issues related to increasing the completion of postsecondary credentials for minority and urban youth.

CCRC seminars are an interactive forum where participants – community college faculty, administrators, presidents, and academic and institutional researchers – present findings, exchange ideas, and explore new areas of study.

Panelists:

John Austin: Vice-President, Michigan State Board of Education; Policy Director, Lt. Governor’s Commission on Higher Education and Economic Growth; Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution
Christine Johnson McPhail: Graduate Coordinator, Community College Leadership Doctoral Program, Morgan State University
Irving Pressley McPhail: Chancellor, The Community College of Baltimore County

Date: Wednesday, April 27, 2005
Time: 11:30am - 2:00pm
Location: 179 Grace Dodge Hall
Teachers College, Columbia University

For more information or to RSVP, please contact CCRC.
UPCOMING CONFERENCE PRESENTATIONS

Council for the Study of Community Colleges
47th Annual Conference
April 7-9, 2005
Boston, Massachusetts

Consuming College Coursework: Students’ Perspectives on Postsecondary Learning
Session Presenters:
  Rebecca Cox, Research Associate, CCRC
Date: Friday, April 8, 2005
Time: 10:15 am – 11:45 am
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 310

Paths to Persistence: An Analysis of Research on Program Effectiveness at Community Colleges
Session Presenters:
  Thomas Bailey, Director, CCRC
  Mariana Alfonso, Research Affiliate, CCRC
Date: Friday, April 8, 2005
Time: 1:00 pm – 2:30 pm
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 301

The Effect of Local Labor Market Conditions on the Education and Economic Outcomes of Community College Students
Session Presenters:
  Gregory Kienzl, Research Affiliate, CCRC
  Juliet Diehl, Research Assistant, American Institutes for Research
Date: Friday, April 8, 2005
Time: 2:45 pm – 4:15 pm
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 310

Community College Student Outcomes: What Institutional Characteristics Make a Difference?
Session Presenters:
  Timothy Leinbach, Research Associate, CCRC
  Juan Carlos Calzagni, Research Fellow, CCRC
Date: Saturday, April 9, 2005
Time: 9:00 am – 10:00 am
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 309

The Effect of Schooling, Work, and Educational Pathways on the Economic Outcomes of Community College Students
Session Presenters:
  Gregory Kienzl, Research Affiliate, CCRC
Date: Saturday, April 9, 2005
Time: 2:45 pm – 3:45 pm
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 303

American Association of Community Colleges
85th Annual Convention
April 9-12, 2005
Boston, Massachusetts

Looking Beyond Tech Prep: Credit Based Transition Programs from High School
Session Presenters:
  James Jacobs, Associate Director for Community College Operations, CCRC
  Thomas Bailey, Director, CCRC
  Arlene Kahn, Director of School/College Collaboration, LaGuardia Community College
  Jeffrey Rafn, President, Northeast Wisconsin Technical College
Date: Sunday, April 10, 2005
Time: 8:45 am – 9:45 am
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 206

Community College Institutional Research: Important But Invisible
Session Presenters:
  Davis Jenkins, Senior Research Affiliate, CCRC
  Dan McConochie, Senior Director, Planning, Research and Evaluation, Community College of Baltimore County
  Gail Mellow, President, LaGuardia Community College
Date: Sunday, April 10, 2005
Time: 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm
Location: Hynes Convention Center, Room 301

Join us at the
CCRC
Open Reception
at the
85th AACC Annual Convention
Sunday, April 10, 2005
Sheraton Boston
39 Dalton Street
Fairfax B
6:30 pm - 9:30 pm
Democratizing or Diverting Dreams in U.S. Higher Education? Community Colleges and Postsecondary Access, Attainment, and Outcomes
Session Presenters: Thomas Bailey, Director, CCRC, Mariana Alfonso, Research Affiliate, CCRC, Davis Jenkins, Senior Research Affiliate, CCRC, Gregory Kienzl, Research Affiliate, CCRC
Date: Monday, April 11, 2005
Time: 12:00 pm – 1:30 pm
Location: InterContinental, Saint-Laurent Room

A Multidimensional Look at Community College Remediation: Policy, Faculty, and Learning
Session Presenters: Dolores Perin, Senior Research Associate, CCRC, Jan Ignash, Associate Professor, Leadership Development Department, University of South Florida, Carol Kozeracki, Assistant Director, Institute for the Study of Educational Entrepreneurship, UCLA, Mary Bendickson, Dean of Arts & Sciences, Hillsborough Community College
Date: Monday, April 11, 2005
Time: 2:15 pm – 3:45 pm
Location: InterContinental, Vieux-Port Room
Community Colleges and Latino Educational Opportunity: A Civil Rights and Policy Conversation
Session Presenters:
- Mariana Alfonso, Research Affiliate, CCRC
- Timothy Leinbach, Research Associate, CCRC
- Laura Gonzalez, Professor, School of Social Sciences, University of Texas at Dallas
- Ann Person, Doctoral Student, Human Development & Social Policy, Institute for Policy Research, Northwestern University
- Kate Dillon Hogan, District Director of Transfer and Articulation, Maricopa Community Colleges
- Stella Flores, Research Assistant, The Civil Rights Project, Harvard University
Discussant:
- Gary Orfield, Co-Director, The Civil Rights Project, Harvard University
Date: Friday, April 15, 2005
Time: 10:35 am – 12:05 pm
Location: InterContinental, Saint-Laurent Room

Association for Institutional Research 2005 Annual Forum
May 29-June 1, 2005
San Diego, California

Early Results from a National Initiative for Strengthening the Use of Institutional Research to Improve Student Outcomes at Community Colleges
Session Presenters:
- Thomas Bailey, Director, CCRC
- Davis Jenkins, Senior Research Affiliate, CCRC
- John B. Lee, President, JBL Associates
- Linda S. Hagedorn, Associate Professor, University of Southern California
- Barbara J. Gill, Director of Educational Research, Tallahassee Community College
- Derek V. Price, Consultant, DVP-Praxis
Date: Tuesday, May 31, 2005
Time: 2:40 pm – 4:10 pm
Location: Marriott Hall 3, NT, Lobby Level

Building Pathways to Success for Low-Skill Adult Students: Lessons for Community College Policy and Practice from a Statewide Longitudinal Tracking Study
Session Presenters:
- Davis Jenkins, Senior Research Affiliate, CCRC
- David W. Prince, Research Manager, Washington State Board for Community and Technical Colleges
Date: Wednesday, June 1, 2005
Time: 3:50 pm – 4:30 pm
Location: Santa Rosa, ST, Level 1, S-W

Please check our website for details and updates http://www.tc.edu/ccrc

SELECTED PUBLICATIONS

Reports and Papers

Building Pathways to Success for Low-Skill Adult Students: Lessons for Community College Policy and Practice from a Statewide Longitudinal Tracking Study
David Prince and Davis Jenkins
Community College Research Center, April 2005
This paper presents findings from a study of the experiences and outcomes of low-skill adults in community colleges. It uses student record information from the Washington State Community and Technical College System to track the progress of two cohorts of adult students 25 or older with, at most, a high school education who entered one of the state's community or technical colleges for the first time in 1996-97 or 1997-98. The study examines the educational attainment of the students to identify the critical filter points or roadblocks at which adult students drop out or fail to advance to the next level.

Paths to Persistence: An Analysis of Research on Program Effectiveness at Community Colleges
Thomas R. Bailey and Mariana Alfonso
Lumina Foundation for Education, New Agenda Series 6(1), 2005
This monograph presents a critical analysis of the state of the research on the effectiveness of specific practices in increasing persistence and completion at community colleges. It also draws substantive lessons about effective institutional practices to identify promising areas for future research, evaluates the state of program-effectiveness research at community colleges, and makes recommendations for improving related research.

The Effects of Institutional Factors on the Success of Community College Students
Thomas Bailey, Juan Carlos Calzagno, Davis Jenkins, Gregory Kienzl, and Timothy Leinbach
Community College Research Center, January 2005
This report measures the institutional characteristics that affect community college student success, particularly for low-income and minority students, using both national institutional and individual student data. Evidence shows that different community colleges enrolling essentially similar types of students may have vastly different graduation rates. Thus, this report, controlling for student characteristics, investigates what characteristics of the institutions might play a role in explaining student outcomes. The analy-
Community College Low-Income and Minority Student Completion Study: Descriptive Statistics from the 1992 High School Cohort
Thomas Bailey, Davis Jenkins, and Timothy Leinbach
Community College Research Center, January 2005
This report summarizes statistics on access and attainment by low-income and minority community college students based on data from the National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988 (NELS:88). It includes detailed charts showing rates of enrollment and completion of various outcomes (certificate, associate degree, bachelor's degree, and transfer to baccalaureate institutions) for students by race/ethnicity, income level, parents' highest level of education, and initial type of institution in which students enrolled. It highlights students who began in community colleges, while comparing their enrollment and completion rates to students at other types of institutions.

What We Know About Community College Low-Income and Minority Student Outcomes: Descriptive Statistics from National Surveys
Thomas Bailey, Davis Jenkins, and Timothy Leinbach
Community College Research Center, January 2005
This report summarizes the latest available national statistics on access and attainment by low-income and minority community college students. The data are drawn from the National Center for Education Statistics' (NCES) Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) and the National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988 (NELS:88). It provides enrollment rates and the total number of different types of credentials earned (certificate, associate degree, bachelor's degree) by race/ethnicity for various years. The report compares the rates across institution types to assess the relative achievement of students at community colleges. PPS:96/01, a survey of all first-time beginning students in postsecondary education in 1995-96, is used to describe enrollment patterns and completion rates by minority and low-income student characteristics of a cohort of first-time students.

Improving Student Attainment in Community Colleges: Institutional Characteristics and Policies
Thomas Bailey, Mariana Alfonso, Juan Carlos Calcagno, Davis Jenkins, Gregory Kienzl, and Timothy Leinbach
Community College Research Center, November 2004
This report has four main goals. First, it provides general descriptive information on community college student characteristics and educational outcomes and makes comparisons with other higher education sectors. Second, it discusses the importance of college completion and transfer, reviewing the controversy about whether completion is a meaningful or justifiable standard for a community college. Third, it reviews the state of research on the determinants of student outcomes in community colleges and provides some programmatic guidance and suggestions for improving research in this area. Finally, the authors initiate their own program of empirical research on institutional graduation rates, using both quantitative and qualitative methods to identify institutional practices that are related to improved student outcomes.

The Characteristics of Occupational Sub-Baccalaureate Students Entering the New Millennium
Thomas Bailey, Timothy Leinbach, Marc Scott, Mariana Alfonso, Gregory Kienzl, Benjamin Kennedy, and David Marcotte
Community College Research Center, in press
This report provides a detailed description of the demographic characteristics, educational background, enrollment patterns, and goals of sub-baccalaureate occupational students. The students are described in comparison with both academic sub-baccalaureate students and baccalaureate students. In addition, the report describes a distinctive subset of the occupational student population: those enrolled in sub-baccalaureate certificate programs.

Educational Outcomes of Occupational Postsecondary Students
Thomas Bailey, Mariana Alfonso, Marc Scott, and Timothy Leinbach
Community College Research Center, in press
This report investigates the extent to which students in occupational programs persist in postsecondary education and attain degrees. The analysis uses a multivariate regression approach to estimate the determinants of persistence and completion of educational goals, with particular emphasis on the effect of a student's program of study. It separately investigates the outcomes of students who, in their initial postsecondary enrollment, are working toward a certificate, an associate degree, or a bachelor's degree. Each of these groups of students is then divided between those in occupational majors and those in academic majors.

The Return to a Sub-Baccalaureate Education: The Effects of Schooling, Credentials, and Program of Study on Economic Outcomes
Thomas Bailey, Gregory Kienzl, and David Marcotte
Community College Research Center, in press
This report estimates the returns to education for sub-baccalaureate occupational students, using high school occupational students without postsecondary education as the reference population. The report also estimates the changes in earnings for academic sub-baccalaureate and baccalaureate students. In addition, it compares the outcomes of sub-baccalaureate and baccalaureate students who fail to earn a credential during their postsecondary enrollment but have...
similar amounts of education to those who do earn credentials. The report also investigates the economic gains from occupational education for students in various demographic categories, such as those who are older, racial/ethnic minorities, academically challenged, or economically disadvantaged, and those students who took vocational courses in high school.

State Dual Enrollment Policies: Addressing Access and Quality
Melinda Mechur Karp, Thomas R. Bailey, Katherine L. Hughes, and Baranda J. Fermin
U.S. Department of Education, Office of Vocational and Adult Education, September 2004
This report analyzes dual enrollment legislation in all 50 states and examines whether these policies promote or inhibit the spread of dual enrollment programs. State Policies identifies ten features by which dual enrollment programs can vary from state to state, including admission requirements, program structure, course content, funding, and whether state policies mandate their existence.

The Role of Community Colleges in State Adult Education Systems: A National Analysis
Vanessa Smith Morest
Council for the Advancement of Adult Literacy, April 2004
This report brings together information on adult education and literacy gathered from several sources, including interviews with state directors of adult education across the country and the National Reporting System (NRS). The aim is to examine the structure of adult education in the United States, with special attention to the role of community colleges.

Books
Working Knowledge: Work-Based Learning and Education Reform
Thomas R. Bailey, Katherine L. Hughes, and David Thornton Moore
RoutledgeFalmer, 2004
Based on over five years of research on work-based learning in high school and community college programs across the country, Working Knowledge explores the potential for using work-based learning as part of a broad education reform strategy. The book also includes techniques practitioners can use for high-quality work-based learning for their students.

The Education Gospel: The Economic Power of Schooling
W. Norton Grubb and Marvin Lazerson
Harvard University Press, 2004
This book examines the Education Gospel—the faith in education as a source of skills for the Knowledge Revolution—and its continuing influence on the economic roles of schooling. In addition to tracing the effects on several educational institutions, including community colleges, the book details the consequences for private as well as public goals, for the correspondence between schooling and work, and for equity.

Articles

Please visit the CCRC website for more information, to download publications, and to sign up for electronic updates: http://www.tc.edu/ccrc
CCRC STAFF

Director:
Thomas R. Bailey, George and Abby O’Neill Professor of Economics and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University and Director, Institute on Education and the Economy

Associate Directors:
James Jacobs, Associate Director for Community College Operations and Director, Center for Workforce Development and Policy, Macomb Community College
Lisa Rothman, Associate Director for Finance, Administration, and Communications

Assistant Directors:
Katherine L. Hughes, Assistant Director for Work and Education Reform Research
Vanessa Smith Morest, Assistant Director for Postsecondary Research

Senior Research Associates and Affiliates:
Mariana Alfonso, Post-doctoral Research Associate, The A. Alfred Taubman Center for Public Policy and American Institutions, Brown University
Kevin Dougherty, Associate Professor of Higher Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
W. Norton Grubb, David Pierpont Gardner Chair in Higher Education, University of California, Berkeley
Davis Jenkins, Senior Fellow, Great Cities Institute, University of Illinois at Chicago
Gregory S. Kienzl, Research Analyst, Education Statistics Services, American Institutes for Research
MoonHee Kim, Deputy Director, Ministry of Education and Human Resources Development, Korea
Dolores Perin, Associate Professor of Psychology and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Stuart Rosenfeld, President, Regional Technology Strategies, Inc.
Kathleen M. Shaw, Associate Professor of Urban Education, Temple University
David Weiman, Professor of Economics, Barnard College, Columbia University

Research Assistants and Fellows:
Juan Carlos Calcagno, Doctoral Student, Economics and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Peter Crosta, Doctoral Student, Economics and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Baranda Fermin, Ed.M. Student, Sociology and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Analía Ivanier, Ed.M. Student, Sociology and Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
H. Kenny Nienhusser, Doctoral Student, Higher and Postsecondary Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Monica Reid, Doctoral Student, Higher and Postsecondary Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Andrea Soonachan, Doctoral Student, Higher and Postsecondary Education, Teachers College, Columbia University
Nathan Walker, Doctoral Student, Higher and Postsecondary Education, Teachers College, Columbia University

Project Assistants:
Lauren O’Gara, M.A Student, Social Studies Education, Teachers College, Columbia University

Website Producer/Technical Specialist:
Lauren Koch, M.A, Instructional Media and Technology, Teachers College, Columbia University

CCRC was established in 1996 by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, and is housed at the Institute on Education and the Economy (IEE) at Teachers College, Columbia University. The continued generosity of the Sloan Foundation and support from other foundations and federal agencies makes the work of CCRC possible.